3<sup>rd</sup> Draft

# Amendment 60 Property Taxes

# 1 Amendment 60 proposes amending the Colorado Constitution to:

- repeal the current voter-approved authority of local governments to keep property taxes above their constitutional limits;
- establish expiration dates for future voter-approved property tax increases:
  - cut local property tax rates for public schools' operating expenses in half over ten years and fully replace this money with state funding each year;
- require publicly owned enterprises to pay property taxes and reduce
  local property tax rates to offset the new revenue; and
- provide new voting rights to certain property owners in Colorado and
  permit citizens to petition all local governments to reduce property
  taxes.

# 14 Summary and Analysis

Amendment 60 changes several aspects of Colorado's property tax system to reduce the amount of property taxes paid by individuals and businesses to school districts, counties, special districts, and cities. The measure phases in a reduction in school district property taxes over ten years and requires that the reduced property taxes be replaced with state funding. Table 1 shows the projected impact of the amendment in today's dollars on an average homeowner and commercial business, school districts, and state government, in both the first year and when the measure is fully implemented. The latter provides the best projections of the measure's final effects.

In the first year, an average homeowner's property tax bill is projected to fall by \$87 and the property taxes for an average commercial business are estimated to fall by \$1,288. The corresponding reduction in property tax collections for school districts is estimated at \$337 million, which the measure requires the state to replace. When the measure is fully implemented, an average homeowner will pay \$376 less and a average commercial business will pay \$5,570 less in property taxes annually. These property tax reductions will increase the state's obligation to kindergarten through twelfth grade education (K-12) by \$1.5 billion. In future years, the actual amounts will differ as inflation and growth increase the size of the economy, but the comparable budget impacts on taxpayers and governments are expected to remain consistent over time. Cities, towns, counties, and special districts will also lose property taxes, but the amount will vary by locality.

Table 1. Selected Impacts of Amendment 60

|   | Amendment 60   |               | dment 60             | Difference     |                      |
|---|----------------|---------------|----------------------|----------------|----------------------|
| Impacted<br>Group   | Current<br>Law | First<br>Year | Fully<br>Implemented | First<br>Year  | Fully<br>Implemented |
| Impacts on Average Taxpayers  |                |               |                      |                |                      |
| Property Tax Payment for<br>Average Homeowner<br>(\$295,000 home)                                 | \$1,638        | \$1,551       | \$1,262              | -\$87          | -\$376               |
| Property Tax Payment for<br>Average Commercial<br>Business Owner with a<br>value of \$1.2 million | \$24,277       | \$22,989      | \$18,703             | -\$1,288       | -\$5,570             |
| K-12 Education Funding Shift  |                |               |                      |                |                      |
| Property Tax Collections for School Districts   | \$3.3 billion  | \$3.0 billion | \$1.8 billion        | -\$0.3 billion | -\$1.5 billion       |
| State Expenditures for K-12 Education   | \$3.7 billion  | \$4.0 billion | \$5.2 billion        | \$0.3 billion  | \$1.5 billion        |

**Background and current law.** Property taxes are based primarily on the value of land, houses, other buildings, and business equipment. Individuals and businesses pay property taxes to various local governments, such as cities, counties, school districts, and special districts, each of which imposes its own tax rate on property. School districts and counties receive approximately 77 percent of all property taxes collected. Publicly owned enterprises, such as city water and sewer systems, municipal airports, and most state universities, are exempt from paying property tax.

Property taxes are spent on a variety of local government services, including public education, police and fire services, roads and bridges, public water and sewer systems, parks and recreation facilities, hospitals, and libraries. The degree to which local governments rely on property taxes to pay for services varies. Some special districts, such as fire protection districts, get almost all of their revenue from property taxes, while many city governments get less than 5 percent of their funding from property taxes.

**Constitutional limits on property taxes**. The state constitution currently restricts the amount of property taxes that a local government can collect each year. Annual increases are capped at the rate of inflation plus a measure of local growth, such as student enrollment in the case of a school district. The constitution also requires voter approval for a local government to increase property tax rates or to keep property taxes above the government's constitutional limit.

How does Amendment 60 change how public schools are funded? Public schools in Colorado are funded from a combination of federal, state, and local sources. Voters in some school districts have approved additional property taxes to repay loans used to build schools or other buildings. In these districts, there is a property tax for operating schools and a separate property tax to repay loans. Amendment 60 requires all districts to cut their 2011 property tax rates for operating schools in half by 2020. Property tax rates for repaying loans are unchanged. The required reduction in tax rates must be done in equal yearly amounts over ten years. Amendment 60 requires the local school district funding eliminated by this rate reduction to be replaced each year with state funding.

How does Amendment 60 affect the state budget? Currently, the state spends most of its general operating budget on: preschool through higher education; health care; prisons; the courts; and programs that help low-income, elderly, and disabled people. K-12 education funding accounts for 49 percent of this budget, which is primarily funded by sales and income taxes. Because Amendment 60 requires that the reduction in local property tax revenue be replaced with state tax revenue, the funding obligation for public schools will increase to an estimated 67 percent of the state's general operating budget, once the measure is fully implemented. To meet this increased obligation to schools, the state will have to decrease spending in other areas, increase fees for other services, or enact some combination of both.

How does Amendment 60 affect property taxes for all local governments? Like school districts, cities, counties, and special districts are also funded from a combination of federal, state, and local sources. Under current law, taxpayers in many communities have voted to exempt their local governments from the constitutional limit related to property taxes. Currently, voters in 76 percent of municipalities, 81 percent of counties, and 98 percent of school districts have voted to allow government to keep and spend property tax revenue above the constitutional limit, either temporarily or permanently. Beginning in 2011, Amendment 60 repeals the current voter-approved authority of local governments to permanently keep property taxes above their constitutional limits. Local governments are not required to refund the property taxes that were retained in the past, but a new election must be held to allow a local government to temporarily keep taxes above its constitutional limit. The measure will also reduce the property tax collections of most local governments by reducing property tax rates, and limiting the duration of future property tax increases.

How does Amendment 60 affect publicly owned enterprises? Amendment 60 requires publicly owned enterprises to pay property taxes. Under current law, state enterprises, such as most public universities, do not pay property taxes on campus buildings or equipment. Similarly, local enterprises, such as Denver International Airport, pay no property taxes. The new property taxes collected from these publicly owned enterprises must be offset by lower property tax rates for homeowners, businesses, and other property taxpayers. For example, if the University of Colorado had to pay property taxes in Boulder County, its property tax bill is estimated to range from \$11 million to \$20 million per year, depending on how the property is valued. This new revenue would be offset by lower tax rates in Boulder County, providing

property owners in the county with additional tax savings. The amendment prohibits publicly owned enterprises from charging either a mandatory fee or a tax on property.

How does Amendment 60 change property tax elections? Amendment 60 proposes changing several aspects of the way property tax issues are addressed in local elections. Under current law, a property owner who is a registered Colorado voter may vote on ballot questions in his or her primary place of residence and in special district elections wherever he or she owns property in Colorado. Amendment 60 allows Colorado property owners to vote on city, county, and school district property tax issues in any Colorado location where they own property, regardless of their primary place of residence in the state.

Under current law, citizens may petition cities to increase or decrease property taxes, but may not petition counties, schools, or special districts. Under this measure, all local governments must permit petitions to lower property taxes.

Typically, when a local community has voted to permanently exempt its local government from the constitutional limit on property tax collections, that voter-approved decision is not automatically repealed at a future date. Under Amendment 60, any future vote to allow a local government to retain revenue above its constitutional limit is repealed within four years after passage. Any future vote to increase property tax rates is repealed within ten years. Any extension of an expiring property tax is considered to be a tax increase under the measure, and as such, must be presented as a tax increase on the ballot.

Currently, a single ballot question may ask voters if a local government may borrow money, and if property tax rates may be increased to repay that loan. Under this measure, ballot questions that allow a government to borrow money must be separate from ballot questions that raise property taxes.

**How is Amendment 60 enforced?** The amendment requires the state to annually audit all cities, counties, school districts, and other types of local governments to ensure compliance with all requirements of the amendment. Citizens are also allowed to file lawsuits to enforce compliance.

How does Amendment 60 interact with two other measures on the ballot? Amendment 60 along with Amendment 61 (see page x) and Proposition 101 (see page x) contain provisions that affect state and local government finances by decreasing taxes paid by households and businesses and restricting government borrowing. How these measures work together may require clarification from the state legislature or the courts.

Amendment 60 reduces local property taxes, while requiring state expenditures for K-12 education to increase by an amount that offsets the property tax loss for school districts. Amendment 61 requires state and local governments to decrease tax rates when debt is repaid, and is assumed in this analysis to apply to the existing debt of state and local governments. Proposition 101 reduces state and local government taxes and fees.

Since portions of these measures are phased in over time, the actual impacts to taxpayers and governments will be less in the initial years of implementation and grow over time. Assuming that all three measures are approved by voters, the first-year impact will be to reduce state taxes and fees by \$717 million and increase state spending for K-12 education by \$385 million. Once fully implemented, the measures are estimated to reduce state taxes and fees by \$2.1 billion and increase state spending for K-12 education by \$1.6 billion in today's dollars. This would commit almost all of the state's general operating budget to paying for the constitutional and statutory requirements of K-12 education. Tax and fee collections by local governments are estimated to decrease by \$5.0 billion, but the net impact on local government budgets would be \$3.4 billion after the state reimburses school districts.

Households and businesses are estimated to save \$1.6 billion in the first year and \$7.1 billion per year in today's dollars when the measures are fully implemented. The measures reduce the taxes and fees owed by an average household making \$55,000 per year that owns a \$295,000 house by an estimated \$400 in the first year and \$1,750 per year when fully implemented.

#### **Arguments For**

- 1) Amendment 60 provides property tax relief for Coloradans in a tough economic climate without reducing K-12 education funding. By lowering property taxes for individuals and families, the amendment will make home ownership more affordable. Allowing business owners to keep more of their income may spur investment and help the economy recover more quickly. School funding is unchanged because the state is required to replace the local property taxes eliminated by the amendment.
- 2) Amendment 60 strengthens citizen control over local government taxes. It sets tax expiration dates and allows voters to approve any extension of an expiring tax. The amendment also allows citizens to petition local governments to lower taxes, and it prevents unelected boards, such as the Denver Water Board, from imposing mandatory fees or taxes on property. In addition, limiting votes on property taxes to November elections, when voter turnout is typically higher, may lead to greater citizen awareness and participation.
- 3) Amendment 60 removes a competitive advantage that publicly owned enterprises have over private businesses. Unlike private facilities, publicly owned enterprises, such as parking lots and golf courses, do not currently pay property taxes. The additional revenue will lower the local property tax rate, reducing property tax bills for property owners in the district.

# **Arguments Against**

1) Amendment 60 overturns nearly two decades of voter-approved tax decisions that fund important services provided by counties, cities, school districts, and special districts. The amendment enables voters statewide, in this election, to reverse

hundreds of decisions of local voters to fund services like fire and police protection, roads, parks and recreational facilities, water and sewer systems, and libraries. Local voters are best equipped to choose the level and type of services needed in their communities and the means to pay for those services.

- 2) Amendment 60 will require the state to cut funding for many important services, resulting in job losses throughout Colorado. Because the state constitution requires that the state have a balanced budget and limits the ability of the legislature to raise taxes, every new dollar spent on education will be taken away from other services. The \$1.5 billion increase in K-12 education spending nearly equals the amount the state currently spends on courts, prisons, and human services. This amendment requires the state to spend so much more on public schools that these or other state functions will have to be cut or eliminated in order to keep the state budget balanced.
- 3) Amendment 60 may leave many citizens worse off financially, depending on where they live. People who live in areas with few publicly owned enterprises, such as the eastern plains, will receive some property tax reductions, but may pay more in fees to use the services of public enterprises located elsewhere. For example, if the University of Colorado must pay property taxes, students statewide may pay more in tuition, but property owners in Boulder County will get most of the tax savings. Similarly, if Denver International Airport must pay property taxes, airline customers statewide may pay more in fees, but only property owners in Denver will get the property tax reduction.

# **Estimate of Fiscal Impact**

**Local revenue.** Amendment 60 reduces property taxes for individuals and business in several ways. This reduces the amount of tax revenue that cities, counties, school districts, and special districts will receive. The measure phases in a reduction in school district property taxes over ten years. In the first year, school district property taxes are projected to fall by \$337 million, reducing property taxes paid by an average homeowner and an average business owner by \$87 and \$1,288, respectively. Once the measure is fully implemented, property taxes are estimated to fall by \$1.5 billion annually in today's dollars, reducing property taxes paid by an average homeowner and an average business owner by approximately \$376 per year and \$5,570 per year, respectively. Additionally, local governments currently authorized to keep property tax revenue in excess of the constitutional limit, will have their property tax revenue reduced by an indeterminate amount.

**State expenditures.** By reducing the amount of local property taxes collected for school districts, statewide expenditures for public schools will increase by an estimated \$337 million in the first year of implementation and by \$1.5 billion per year in today's dollars once the measure is fully implemented. To meet this increased obligation to schools, the state will have to decrease spending in other areas, increase fees for other services, or enact some combination of both.

# 3<sup>rd</sup> Draft

The state must make a yearly audit of compliance with the property tax provisions and strictly enforce all requirements in the amendment. The Office of the State Auditor is responsible for reporting the financial and operational performance of agencies of state government; however, the office does not have a process for auditing local government compliance with property tax laws. Amendment 60 expands the obligations of the State Auditor's Office. It is estimated that this provision will require the addition of 1.5 new staff to coordinate year-round auditing of local government and to manage contracting with independent certified public accounting (CPA) firms. The cost for these new staff and CPA contracts is estimated to be \$800,000 each year.