

Colorado Legislative Council Staff

Room 029 State Capitol, Denver, CO 80203-1784 (303) 866-3521 FAX: 866-3855 TDD: 866-3472

MEMORANDUM

April 22, 2009

TO:

Representative Claire Levy

Members of the House Judiciary Committee

FROM:

Clare Pramuk, Fiscal Analyst (303-866-2677)

SUBJECT:

Fiscal Assessment of Proposed Amendment SB110 L.013.

This memorandum is an assessment of the fiscal impact of the attached proposed amendment to **SB09-110**. This fiscal assessment is for the impact of the bill with inclusion of this amendment <u>only</u>. Any other added amendment could influence the fiscal impact.

Summary of Proposed Amendment

Amendment L.013 adds to the bill the ability of a complaining party or plaintiff whose claim of discrimination is not covered by federal law, to recover compensatory and punitive damages as well as attorney fees and costs. Damages are limited based on employer size. The amendment removes the entitlement of a charging party whose claim cannot be brought under Title VII of the Civil Rights Act of 1964, to a formal hearing before the Civil Rights Commission, or an administrative law judge.

Fiscal Impact of Amendment

The amendment increases the fiscal impact shown in the fiscal note dated March 30, 2009, to the Colorado Civil Rights Division (CCRD) in the Department of Regulatory Agencies, the State Risk Management Division in the Department of Personnel and Administration, and the Department of Law by \$578,483 and 8.4 FTE in FY 2009-10 and \$464,194 and 7.1 FTE in FY 2010-11. The expansion of remedies available to complaining parties or plaintiffs is expected to increase caseloads and require additional outreach efforts. The CCRD would require additional staff to respond to inquiries, draft complaints and investigate cases. The Department of Law would provide legal support to the CCRD and the Risk Management Division.

All state agencies would be subject to increased liability in discrimination cases. Agencies would be defended and billed by the Department of Law and in cases where agencies do not prevail, they may be required to pay up to \$300,000 in compensatory damages. Estimates of defense costs and damages are not included in the fiscal impact.

Bill's Revised Fiscal Impact with Amendment

The bill would have a total fiscal impact of \$578,483 and 8.4 FTE in FY 2009-10 and \$464,194 and 7.1 FTE in FY 2010-11 with the adoption of L.013 as shown below.

- Department of Regulatory Agencies, CCRD General Fund increase of \$443,303 and 7.3 FTE in FY 2009-10 and \$329,014 and 6.0 FTE in FY 2010-11; and
- **Department of Law** \$157,710 and 1.1 FTE in both FY 2009-10 and FY 2010-11, reappropriated funds from the Division of Regulatory Agencies and the Department of Personnel and Administration.

HOUSE COMMITTEE OF REFERENCE REPORT

Chairman of Committee	Date
Committee on <u>Judiciary</u> .	
After consideration on the merits, the Common following:	nittee recommends the
SB09-110 be amended as follows:	
Amend reengrossed bill, page 4, line 25, strike "	'(4),".
Page 8, strike lines 5 through 24.	
Page 10, before line 9, insert the following:	
"SECTION 8. 24-34-405, Colorado REPEALED AND REENACTED, WITH AME	
24-34-405. Relief authorized. (1) (a) RELIEF AUTHORIZED BY SECTION 24-34-306 (9), TOURT MAY ORDER AFFIRMATIVE RELIEF THAT THE DETERMINES TO BE APPROPRIATE, INCLUDING, WITFOLLOWING:	THE COMMISSION OR THE COMMISSION OR COURT
(I) REINSTATEMENT OR HIRING OF EMPLOY BACK PAY, WHICH, IF AWARDED, SHALL BE PA EMPLOYMENT AGENCY, OR LABOR ORGANIZATION DISCRIMINATORY OR UNFAIR EMPLOYMENT PRACE	ID BY THE EMPLOYER, NRESPONSIBLE FOR THE
(II) FRONT PAY; OR	
(III) ANY OTHER EQUITABLE RELIEF DEEMI COMMISSION OR COURT.	ED APPROPRIATE BY THE
(b) If the commission or court of	POERS RACK DAV THE



- 1 LIABILITY FOR BACK PAY SHALL ACCRUE FROM A DATE NOT MORE THAN
- 2 TWO YEARS PRIOR TO THE FILING OF A CHARGE WITH THE DIVISION. THE
- 3 COMMISSION OR COURT SHALL REDUCE AN AWARD OF BACK PAY BY ANY
- 4 AMOUNT OF ACTUAL EARNINGS OF, OR AMOUNTS THAT COULD HAVE BEEN
- 5 EARNED WITH REASONABLE DILIGENCE BY, THE PERSON WHO WAS THE
- 6 VICTIM OF THE DISCRIMINATORY OR UNFAIR EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE.
- 7 (2) (a) IN ADDITION TO THE RELIEF AVAILABLE PURSUANT TO 8 SUBSECTION (1) OF THIS SECTION, IN A PROCEEDING OR CIVIL ACTION 9 BROUGHT BY A COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF UNDER THIS PART 4 10 AGAINST A RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT WHO IS FOUND TO HAVE ENGAGED 11 IN AN INTENTIONAL DISCRIMINATORY OR UNFAIR EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE, 12 THE COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF MAY RECOVER COMPENSATORY 13 AND PUNITIVE DAMAGES AS SPECIFIED IN THIS SUBSECTION (2). A 14 COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF SHALL NOT BE AWARDED 15 COMPENSATORY OR PUNITIVE DAMAGES WHEN THE RESPONDENT OR 16 DEFENDANT IS FOUND TO HAVE ENGAGED IN AN EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE

THAT IS UNLAWFUL SOLELY BECAUSE OF ITS DISPARATE IMPACT.

- 18 (b) A COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF MAY RECOVER PUNITIVE 19 DAMAGES AGAINST A RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT, OTHER THAN A 20 GOVERNMENT, GOVERNMENT AGENCY, OR POLITICAL SUBDIVISION OF THE 21 STATE, IF THE COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF DEMONSTRATES BY A 22 PREPONDERANCE OF THE EVIDENCE THAT THE RESPONDENT OR 23 DEFENDANT ENGAGED IN A DISCRIMINATORY OR UNFAIR EMPLOYMENT 24 PRACTICE WITH MALICE OR RECKLESS INDIFFERENCE TO THE RIGHTS OF 25 THE COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF.
- 26 (c) A COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF MAY RECOVER
 27 COMPENSATORY DAMAGES AGAINST A RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT FOR
 28 FUTURE PECUNIARY LOSSES, EMOTIONAL PAIN, SUFFERING,
 29 INCONVENIENCE, MENTAL ANGUISH, LOSS OF ENJOYMENT OF LIFE, AND
 30 OTHER NONPECUNIARY LOSSES.
- 31 (d) The total amount of damages awarded pursuant to 32 This subsection (2) shall not exceed the following amounts for 33 Each complaining party or plaintiff, regardless of whether the 34 Damages are compensatory, punitive, or a combination of 35 Compensatory and punitive damages:
- 36 (I) IF THE RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT HAS FOURTEEN OR FEWER



17

1 EMPLOYEES IN EACH OF TWENTY OR MORE CALENDAR WEEKS IN EITHER
2 THE CURRENT OR PRECEDING CALENDAR YEAR, TWENTY-FIVE THOUSAND
3 DOLLARS;

- 4 (II) IF THE RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT HAS FIFTEEN OR MORE 5 EMPLOYEES AND ONE HUNDRED OR FEWER EMPLOYEES IN EACH OF TWENTY OR MORE CALENDAR WEEKS IN EITHER THE CURRENT OR PRECEDING CALENDAR YEAR, FIFTY THOUSAND DOLLARS;
- 8 (III) IF THE RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT HAS MORE THAN ONE 9 HUNDRED AND TWO HUNDRED OR FEWER EMPLOYEES IN EACH OF TWENTY 10 OR MORE CALENDAR WEEKS IN EITHER THE CURRENT OR PRECEDING 11 CALENDAR YEAR, ONE HUNDRED THOUSAND DOLLARS;
- 12 (IV) IF THE RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT HAS MORE THAN TWO
 13 HUNDRED EMPLOYEES AND FIVE HUNDRED OR FEWER EMPLOYEES IN EACH
 14 OF TWENTY OR MORE CALENDAR WEEKS IN EITHER THE CURRENT OR
 15 PRECEDING CALENDAR YEAR, TWO HUNDRED THOUSAND DOLLARS; AND
- 16 (V) If the respondent or defendant has more than five 17 HUNDRED EMPLOYEES IN EACH OF TWENTY OR MORE CALENDAR WEEKS IN 18 EITHER THE CURRENT OR PRECEDING CALENDAR YEAR, THREE HUNDRED 19 THOUSAND DOLLARS.
- 20 (e) COMPENSATORY OR PUNITIVE DAMAGES AWARDED PURSUANT
 21 TO THIS SUBSECTION (2) SHALL BE IN ADDITION TO, AND SHALL NOT
 22 INCLUDE, FRONT PAY, BACK PAY, INTEREST ON BACK PAY, OR ANY OTHER
 23 TYPE OF RELIEF AWARDED PURSUANT TO SUBSECTION (1) OF THIS SECTION.
- 24 (3) IN CASES ALLEGING THAT A RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT 25 ENGAGED IN A DISCRIMINATORY OR UNFAIR EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE BY 26 FAILING TO PROVIDE A REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION TO A PERSON WITH 27 A DISABILITY WHO IS OTHERWISE QUALIFIED, IT SHALL BE AN AFFIRMATIVE 28 DEFENSE TO AN AWARD OF DAMAGES UNDER THIS SECTION THAT THE 29 RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT DEMONSTRATED GOOD FAITH EFFORTS, IN 30 CONSULTATION WITH THE PERSON WITH THE DISABILITY WHO INFORMED 31 THE RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT THAT AN ACCOMMODATION WAS 32 NEEDED, TO IDENTIFY AND MAKE A REASONABLE ACCOMMODATION THAT 33 WOULD PROVIDE THE PERSON WITH THE DISABILITY WITH AN EQUALLY 34 EFFECTIVE OPPORTUNITY AND WOULD NOT CAUSE AN UNDUE HARDSHIP ON 35 THE OPERATION OF THE BUSINESS.

1	(4) (a) If a person was refused admission into or suspended
2	OR EXPELLED FROM A UNION, WAS REFUSED EMPLOYMENT OR
3	ADVANCEMENT, OR WAS SUSPENDED OR DISCHARGED FROM EMPLOYMENT,
4	AND THE LABOR ORGANIZATION OR EMPLOYER, AS APPLICABLE, TOOK THE
5	ACTION FOR ANY BONA FIDE REASON OTHER THAN A DISCRIMINATORY OR
6	UNFAIR EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE, THE COMMISSION OR A COURT SHALL NOT
7	ISSUE AN ORDER REQUIRING, AS APPLICABLE:
8	(I) A LABOR ORGANIZATION TO ADMIT OR REINSTATE THE PERSON
9	AS A MEMBER OF A UNION;
10	(II) AN EMPLOYER TO HIRE, REINSTATE, OR PROMOTE THE
11	INDIVIDUAL; OR
10	
12	(III) THE EMPLOYER TO PAY THE INDIVIDUAL BACK PAY.
13	(b) IF THE COMPLAINING PARTY OR PLAINTIFF ESTABLISHES THAT
14	THE RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT ENGAGED IN A DISCRIMINATORY OR
15	UNFAIR EMPLOYMENT PRACTICE AND THE RESPONDENT OR DEFENDANT
16	DEMONSTRATES THAT HE, SHE, OR IT WOULD HAVE TAKEN THE SAME
17	ACTION IN THE ABSENCE OF THE IMPERMISSIBLE, MOTIVATING FACTOR, THE
18	COMMISSION OR COURT:
19	(I) MAY GRANT ANY DECLARATORY RELIEF AND INJUNCTIVE
20	RELIEF THE COMMISSION OR COURT DEEMS APPROPRIATE, TOGETHER WITH
21	REASONABLE ATTORNEY FEES AND COSTS THAT THE COMPLAINING PARTY
22	OR PLAINTIFF HAS DEMONSTRATED TO BE ATTRIBUTABLE TO THE PURSUIT
23	OF THE CLAIM OR COMPLAINT; AND
24	(II) SHALLNOT AWARD COMPENSATORY OR PUNITIVE DAMAGES OR
	TOOTIE IN ORDER REGIMENTO LINE IN CONTROL STREET

- 24 (II) SHALL NOT AWARD COMPENSATORY OR PUNITIVE DAMAGES OR
 25 ISSUE AN ORDER REQUIRING ANY ADMISSION, REINSTATEMENT, HIRING,
 26 PROMOTION, OR PAYMENT OF BACK PAY, AS DESCRIBED IN PARAGRAPH (a)
 27 OF THIS SUBSECTION (4).
- 28 (5) If a complaining party or plaintiff in a proceeding 29 Before the commission or in a civil action filed under this part 4 30 Seeks compensatory or punitive damages pursuant to subsection 31 (2) of this section:
- 32 (a) Any party in the civil action may demand a trial by Jury; and



1	(b) THE COURT IN THE CIVIL ACTION SHALL NOT INFORM THE JURY
2	OF THE LIMITATIONS DESCRIBED IN PARAGRAPH (d) OF SUBSECTION (2) OF
3	THIS SECTION.

- 4 (6) (a) IN ANY PROCEEDING OR CIVIL ACTION UNDER THIS PART 4,
 5 THE COMMISSION OR COURT MAY AWARD REASONABLE ATTORNEY FEES
 6 AND COSTS TO THE PREVAILING PARTY UNLESS THE PREVAILING PARTY IS
 7 A GOVERNMENT, GOVERNMENT AGENCY, OR POLITICAL SUBDIVISION OF
 8 THE STATE.
- 9 (b) NOTWITHSTANDING PARAGRAPH (a) OF THIS SUBSECTION (6),
 10 IN ANY PROCEEDING OR CIVIL ACTION UNDER THIS PART 4 AGAINST A
 11 JUDICIAL OFFICER FOR AN ACT OR OMISSION TAKEN IN THE OFFICER'S
 12 JUDICIAL CAPACITY, THE JUDICIAL OFFICER SHALL NOT BE LIABLE FOR ANY
 13 COSTS OR ATTORNEY FEES UNLESS THE ACTION WAS CLEARLY OUTSIDE THE
 14 SCOPE OF THE OFFICER'S JURISDICTION.
- 15 (c) It is the intent of the general assembly that the
 16 Commission's or court's discretion to award reasonable
 17 Attorney fees and costs shall be guided by standards
 18 Established through judicial interpretation of the discretion
 19 Given to courts to make such awards in cases brought under
 20 Title VII of the federal "Civil Rights Act of 1964", as amended.
- 21 (7) This section shall not apply to claims alleging a Violation of section 24-34-402.5.".
- 23 Renumber succeeding sections accordingly.

** *** ** *** **



		·
·		